

Overview

The best are strong yet flexible and resist weathering, impacts, and lifting.

✓ CR Best Buy

All offer top value and are recommended. Prices are per square (100 square feet).

✓ Recommended

These high-scoring models stand out from the crowd for the reasons below.

Best for most; all are fine values:

- A6 Tamko \$125
- A7 Owens Corning \$70 CR Best Buy
- A8 CertainTeed \$105
- A9 CertainTeed \$65 CR Best Buy
- A10 Atlas \$90
- B1 Atlas \$135

Most are available with algae resistance for damp areas. Paying more for **A6** or **A8** buys more weather resistance or a longer warranty. **B1** was tops among flatter three-tab shingles.

Even tougher but pricier:

- A1 Owens Corning \$225
- A2 CertainTeed \$215
- A14 Tamko \$150

A1 and **A2** were strongest and carry 10-year full coverage for materials. **A14** proved less resilient in our strength tests but is the best choice for areas where high winds are common.

Other tested types

We tested four composite shingles that look like real slate, are warranted for 50 years, and have Class-A fire ratings. We also tested a new take on metal.

Our fake slate included CertainTeed Symphony, DaVinci Slate, EcoStar Majestic Slate, and Tamko Lamarite Slate. All weigh about the same as asphalt, and most cost about \$450 per 100 square feet. The CertainTeed costs less but faded in our tests. One of 10 DaVinci shingles and two of 10 Tamko shingles cracked under impact.

The steel Tamko Metalworks, \$275 per 100 square feet, is light and didn't fade. Flames only charred its finish. Some reflective color choices can net you up to \$1,500 in energy rebates. But it dented and was noisiest, though its textured surface hid minor damage in our tests.

The bottom line. For the look of real slate, consider the CertainTeed or EcoStar, which faded but didn't crack. The Tamko Metalworks is a good choice if you like the look of metal. And be sure to use an installer familiar with the material.



Ratings Roofing

✓ CR Best Buy
✓ Recommended

● Excellent ● Very good ○ Good ● Fair ● Poor

In performance order, within types. (Types designated A and B.)

Recommendation	Rank	Product	Price 100 sq. ft.	Overall score 0 100 P F G V G E	Weight (lb.) 100 sq. ft.	Test results				Warranty	
						Strength	Wind	Weathering	Impact	10-yr. full	Materials (yr.)

A LAMINATED SHINGLES They're relatively thick and mimic the look of wood or slate.

✓	1	Owens Corning Berkshire Collection	\$225	87	371	●	○	●	●	●	life
✓	2	CertainTeed Grand Manor	215	87	430	●	○	●	●	●	life
	3	IKO Crowne Slate	220	86	243	●	●	●	●	●	life
	4	CertainTeed Presidential Shake	215	69	347	●	○	●	●	●	life
	5	GAF-Elk Camelot	215	68	459	●	○	○	●	●	life
✓	6	Tamko Heritage 50	125	68	308	●	○	●	●		50
✓	7	Owens Corning Oakridge	70	67	247	●	○	●	●		30
✓	8	CertainTeed Landmark Premium	105	67	296	●	○	●	●	●	life
✓	9	CertainTeed Landmark	65	66	257	●	○	●	●		30
✓	10	Atlas Pinnacle	90	61	223	●	○	●	●		35
	11	IKO Cambridge 30 AR (East)	85	60	215	○	○	●	●		30
	12	GAF-Elk Timberline Prestique Lifetime	105	60	337	○	●	●	●	●	life
	13	Tamko Heritage 30	90	59	244	●	●	●	●		30
✓	14	Tamko Heritage Vintage	150	59	390	○	●	●	○		50
	15	GAF-Elk Timberline Natural Shadow	85	59	242	○	●	○	●		30
	16	Owens Corning Duration	70	58	240	●	●	○	●		30
	17	Malarkey #273 Legacy	340	58	275	○	●	●	●	●	50
	18	Owens Corning Duration Premium	110	53	259	○	○	○	●	●	life

B THREE-TAB SHINGLES These are thinner and lighter but lack the depth of laminated shingle.

✓	1	Atlas StormMaster Slate	135	61	239	○	○	●	●		life
	2	GAF-Elk Royal Sovereign	70	59	215	○	●	●	●		25
	3	Atlas GlassMaster	75	58	192	○	●	●	●		25
	4	Malarkey #204 Dura-Seal	200	58	245	○	○	○	●		25
	5	CertainTeed XT 25	60	58	220	○	●	●	●		25
	6	IKO Gentry Ultra AR	85	57	225	○	●	●	●		30
	7	Tamko Elite Glass-Seal	70	55	222	○	●	●	●		25
	8	Owens Corning Supreme AR	60	55	233	○	●	○	●		25

Guide to the Ratings

Overall score is based on performance in lab tests, with strength more heavily weighted. Displayed scores are rounded; products are listed in order of precise overall score. **Strength** denotes flexibility and resistance to tearing, stretching, and nail pull-through. **Wind** is how well edges resisted lifting force, based on how well shingles held together. **Weathering** simulates resistance to elements, based on successive exposure to water spray, intense heat, and ultraviolet light. **Impact** is resistance at 0° F to blows from 5-pound weight simulating tree limbs or other fallen objects. Under **warranty, 10-year full** covers full replacement of defective materials; **materials** warranty offers prorated coverage. Price is approximate retail per square (100 square feet).